The Noetic Paradise and Biblia Arabica

9 JAN 2020

by Alexander Treiger

An analysis of Biblical citations in an Arabic Christian text can often help determine whether this text was originally written in Arabic or translated from another language, such as Greek, Syriac, or Coptic. In the case of *The Noetic Paradise (al-Firdaws al-'aqli*) this analysis not only conclusively demonstrates that it is a translation (from Greek), but also sheds unexpected light on one Arabic translation of the Pauline Epistles.

First, a few words on *The Noetic Paradise* are in order. This is an intriguing and rather lengthy mystical treatise which was quite popular among Arabic-speaking Christians from (at least) the twelfth century to the nineteenth, to judge from the large number of manuscripts (66 in total, the oldest – Sinai ar. 483 – dating to 1187). With the exception of the last chapter, *The Noetic Paradise* has not been edited, though some excerpts have been translated into English and Russian.[1]

The basic idea of *The Noetic Paradise* is that at the dawn of creation, human mind ('aql, corresponding to what both the Greek philosophers and the Church Fathers call voῦς) fell from the realm to which it had originally belonged – the angelic world of contemplation. In its fallen state it is being constantly distracted by passions (anger, envy, lust, pride, acedia, vain glory, etc.) and, consequently, unable to contemplate. In line with much Greek Patristic literature, *The Noetic Paradise* urges us to fight against the passions, so as to attain the state of "dispassion" ('adam al-ālām, translating the Evagrian concept of ἀπάθεια) and to be readmitted into the angelic world of contemplation, our mind's erstwhile homeland from which it was exiled.



Image 1: Sinai ar. NF Paper 1 (copied in 1262), fol. 9r – title page of *The Noetic Paradise*; on the margins: unknown text. I thank Father Justin for generously sharing the image and granting permission to publish it.

14.10.24, 15:20

The Noetic Paradise and Biblia Arabica - Biblia Arabica

What of the Biblical citations in *The Noetic Paradise*? There are dozens of them scattered throughout the treatise. In my initial soundings I decided to focus on those coming from the Pauline Epistles. I was hoping to see whether these citations matched any of the known Arabic translations of the Pauline Epistles. If they did, this would be a strong argument that *The Noetic Paradise* was originally written in Arabic – the author would then have simply lifted the citations from an Arabic Biblical translation at his disposal. If they did not, this could be circumstantial evidence in favour of the translation hypothesis (though, of course, this evidence would not be conclusive: the author could have used an Arabic translation that we do not know about or could have translated extemporaneously from memory).

What I discovered, however, surprised me. On the one hand, the citations were strikingly similar to a particular Arabic translation of the Pauline Epistles – the one which Vevian Zaki in her landmark Munich PhD dissertation (supervised by Ronny Vollandt, soon to be published in Brill's "Biblia Arabica" book series) has christened Arab^{Gr3}.[2] This translation is preserved in an Epistle lectionary (the oldest manuscript of which is Sinai ar. 169, dating to 1178) and was subsequently printed in the Paris and London Polyglot Bibles. On the other hand, however, the similarity was not close enough: the two texts frequently chose different words or turns of phrase to translate the same Greek lexical items; occasionally, it was even evident that the Arabic in the two cases reflected discordant Greek variants.[3]

. قالنان متالهمهدليا المذاحة ville. initabl 15 3 1 1 1 5 3 1 1 1 5 1 1 S ينا بالقفل كذلك لخ بازينفذ تدانتا اوتقالت

Image 2: Sinai ar. 164 (copied in 1238), fol. 146v – a page from 2 Corinthians (including the passage discussed below) in the Arab^{Gr3} version, in Vevian Zaki's classification. I thank Father Justin for generously sharing the image and granting permission to publish it.

CAP.X.

CAP. X.

، فادۇنى 7

AD CORINTHIOS M.

Verfio VULGATA LATINA

Si

in illos,

• الأحك التابين عشر بندك العنصين . * وَأَدَرْمُ هَذَا مَنْ يَزْجَ بِشَجْ هَدُ بِنُوا وَحَنْ يُزْجَ بِبَرَكَانٍ مَسَحَصُلٌ بِبَرَكَاتٍ جَزَلَة مَعُوافَرًا * كُلُ أَحْدٍ كَا قَدْ سَبَعْ

يُّ فَيْنَا شَكَّمُ اللَّهِ • ثُمَّ • فِلْآءُ الْآَبِعَامِنَ أَكْمَعُهُ أَلَّالِيَّهُ عَشَرَبُعُهُ العَدْمَ

عليها عنها علم المربع المربع المربع المربع المعالي المديني مقط من وللوادة في المالي 1: * لاَنَّ الْمُسْعَالَ هذه المُحْدَمَة لَيْسَ هُوَ لاَيَّامٍ مَعْوَلاً اللَّذَيْسَ مُقطَ المُراحَة للسَوَّة في الم وَكَنَّنِ السَّمْرِ للَهِ * وَمَهْدَنِبَ هذه المُحْدَمَة مُعَدَّدُينَ اللَّهُ عَظَ طَاعَة المُراحَة للسَوَّة الس

وَتَعَكَّى سَحَةَ سَرَكَيْكُمُ الْمَرْدَةِ اللَّهِمَ عَلَيْ النَّكُلُّ * وَتَشَكَّرُونَ لَهُ عَلَيهَ عَلَيهَ المَداوكَمُ لِنَسَانَ السَبِيعَ ، وو وَتَعَكَّى سَحَةَ سَرَكَيْكُمُ الْمَرْدَةِ اللَّهِمَ عَلَيْ النَّكُلُّ * وَتَشَكُرُونَ لَهُ وَ طِلَيَةٍ مِنْ الْجَلُّ مُ نَافَقَتَ ، اللَّهُمُ مِنْ الْجَلُ فَيَعَ الْمُكْمَ مِنْ اجْلِ فِعَدِ اللَّهُ المَوْطِ السَّاسَةِ مَعَلَيْكُمْ * وَلَهِ السَّمُّرُ عَلَيهُ مَوْمِيَهِ الْ

• أَلَعَصْلُ أَلْعَاسُ

* وَمَا بَنَصْ نَفْسَى اللَّهُ، بِيَوَاعَدَ السِيحَ وَعَمَدِ اللَّذِي أَمَّا عَمَدَمَ الَوَدِ وَلَالَ فَنْصُرْ وَعَالِنَا مَنْكَ مَلَيْكَمَ اللَّهُمَ اللَّكُمُ اللَّكُونَ إِذَا حَصَرْتُ أَنَ الَتَّ كَانَتُ اللَّذِي أَفْتَ مِنْدَهُ ولَعَنْتِي عَلَيْكَمُ اللَّذِي اللَّذِي عَسُوْنِنَا كَانا مُسَسَّرِنَ عَا عَصَ اللَّذِي عَالَي اللَّذِي أَفْتَ ع سَلِكَمُ اللَّسَنَ مَا عَمَدُهُمَا عَضُوْنَا بَاللَّشَ إِنَّا مُسَسَّرِنَ عَالَي اللَّذِي اللَّهُ عَلَيْهُ اللَّ

للدُّبُ المُعَدَّدِينَ اللَّهِ عَلَمَ الْمُصَوْنِ * مَامِسُ الْأَكْرَوْكُمَ عَلَوْ سَنَدْلِي عَلَمَوْدَ الله .

سُلِيْنِ كُلْ فَطْنَة وَرَبِهِ إِنَّ طَاعَة السَبِّ وَلَنَّا اسْتِدَاءُ أَنْ تَنْتَقُمُ مِنْ كُلْ مَعْصِبَة إِذَا كُلُ هُ

* إِمَّا تَبْصِرونَ ٱلْأَسْيَاءَ ٱلطَّلِقِينَ عَمَدَ الْوَجْهِ.

• قُوا آمَمْ أَكْمَهُمْ مِنَ أَكْمُعُدْ ٱلْتَالِيَّةِ عَسَ

ا قَلْدَ لا من حُزْن وَلاَ مِنْ الْزَامِ وَمَانَ اللَّهُ يَحِبُ الْمُعْلَى الْبَالَسَ * وَاللَّهُ قَامَدُانَ يَكُذُ لَكُمْ 8 (يَجْهُ وَلِحُسَانِ الْبَكُونَ لَكُمْ فَي كُلُّ أَمَر كَامُ القَمَاءَةِ وَإِمَاءَ وَتَقَصَّلُونَ فِي كُلُّ عَلَ (يَجْهُ وَلِحُسَانِ البَكُونَ لَكُمْ فَي كُلُ أَمَر كَامُ القَمَاءَةِ وَإِمَاءَ وَتَقَصَّلُونَ فِي كُلُو عَلَي

لاً وتُعْطَعُ اللَّقَوْلَةِ مَعْدَلُهُ مَنْقَى إِلَى الَّذِي * وَالرَّانِ الَّزَارِعِ زَرْهَا وَاللَّا مَكُل مُدَرًا . زَرْدَكُم 10 رَحِمْمُ وَيُنْبِي عَانًا عَمْالَكُمْ * مُسْعَنِين فِي كُلِ أَمْرِيكَافَهُ السَّحَاهُ وَالسَّمَاهَ، (آَتَنِ 11

Verho ARABICA cum Interpretatione LATINA.

Ipre

CAP. X.

والا د

744

EPISTOLA B. PAULI

& feninan in zi 8 aneipur in

(Sicut (Ka3a)

ejus manet in di

TXXd

2600

'ENIETOAH' NPO'S KOPINO. B'. KEO, O'. I'.

Gentis auton Deo fuper inenterabili ejus dono. Xeges 3 ru Geo int ri erecernyhry aure Auges

CAP. X. /. vos upião fe sute rde 3 1: qui 8: oc Rogo Alou x. 3 I nos 13 Cart 780

ad efen my ais Atwer nice justitis fla & fran-aden feminanti, ir mique të mi ufum, & aqua upar, & aqua adoperatur per nos gratiarum neffynderau di num evant hujus non folkan git anfer rauras a ubror be regard ale 7 iyla

Start Ut

mir ley

iftitla aut ex necellitate

Verfio SIRIACA cum Interpre

* الأراب من ورود منه عنا. أنه منه من المن من ورود من ورود من ورود من ورود من ورود من ورود من من الم ورد * فلاف أبو رام متحققه، الا من أبو رض منها، أه أبو رض ٢ مر این که می مرد این ایس وجب عبسار. ای ایس وجب عبسار. ای ایس وجب میں، ایمفرر می محکمی می موم را در این می مراب این ایس وجب می ، مخدم من من المنقع حدة بده مدة المحد، * إسو زميريد، بعرز منهم حصمونا، مارمعمان و الكرة، حقلا حد احدكمر. * مَن بْم المن من الخرا حداد مد معا حصات حدار . من الملا ٥ ا هازا درومقادم. * بعقلا عدم الحدرة, مقد ١٢ الدُور ، حديث العدما العدما المراج المراع المراع المراع ١٠ منترة الم معقد الم الله الم عند من مكان مكان المحاد عديم الم المحاد عديم الم المحاد معتم الم المحاد المعتمد من والمعتمد ما المرا الحدة (معدست ، والمحد من المحد الم حدود مكان المحد المحد من الم المعدر امرا معصمين المسلمين والمنابع المسلمين المعالي المعالمين المعلمين المعلمين المعالمين المعالمين المعالي معالي المعالي المعالي المعالي المعالي معالي المعالي معالي المعالي معالي المعالي المعالي معالي المعالي معالي معالي معالي المعالي المعالي معالي معالي المعالي معالي المدامة المدامة

CAP. X. * مُغَالْ، * مَ *

سَبِ حَفْضًا * إِنَّ * إِنَّ مُعْضًا * ا أَبْرَا هُمحُمع قُدًا إِبْرَا صَعَمَة . حيسماه م ano olonoio 50 ·. 1 القب معمود إنبا حمامة، الأخر أسم إنبا الصلاقاً حمّمة من مُعْتَ يُعمد .. الأصل المالية الإرجر معمداً الإسلامي من الموسعة المواحمة الا إنقا الحص المعجب في أس المحمة معض عمداً إلى القي ا الأرب : من أب المحمد الم بسعجم کے آزمو بضح ألا لا تفار بقص کے آزمو بضح أن اللہ اللہ میں الل مست، * أستار من رفد من من ال موم بمعزاد ال المراج موقد محصمت معتد مترور معتد عند معتد ما معتد ما معد المعتد المعتد عن المعتد عن المعتد المعتد المعتد المع معاد مع معتد بر معتم معتد معتد معتد معتد معتد معتد ما معتد ما معتد المعتد المعتد المعتد المعتد المعتد المعتد ال * مَحَكَمُ حِمْنَ حَمْدَهُمْ المَعَمَا عَسَمَ مُحَمَعَ الاعْدِمُ محمود * مُدا (العَدَمَ هُ) مُعمَّ محمد عامق، * معرفه المعم المحمة، في المعامين من المحمد المحمد المحمد ال وه. مُنَاتَبُ مَع مُعَده، إلى ومَن أَكْنَهُ مُنْ مُعَالًا إلى . مُعَدًا أَه سنَّ.

Verfio & THIOPICA cum Interpretatione LATINA. lemiaat, baie fimiliter parca evit ediffione metet. Et quifque ficut e ellex uccefficate, fed bilare dent: q

ጣሁ : ይጠው 2 . ሎቲ : ማንደር : ወዝስ : ይና ዋና ወቀና / => ወዝሱ : በለው : እድም ፡ በልኩ : ይገብ / ፡፡ የተለጉ : በለው : እድም ፡ በልኩ : ይገብ / ፡፡ የረመስ : ስደሀቡ : ንስው : እውጡ : እውኪሉ : ይነው አብስር ፣ እደድ ና ፡፡ እው ፡ በንጉዳ - አካሪ ፡፡ እው ፡ በንጉዳ - አካሪ ፡፡ እው ፡ በንጉዳ - አካሪ ፡፡ እው ፡ በ ፡፡ እው ፡ በ ፡፡ እርጉ ፡፡ እው ፡ ሰብር ወይነ ዶብዝላ

68	الى فكر السم	وَالْمُسَمَّحُ كُنَ	هذا الله كام	لربي دايد أيضا	ج ، فليفتر
- 1-				im Interpretati	
10 ወውንቱ ፡ ደሁብ ፡ ዘርአ		A440 @PIL	non: 0PAHA:	Anon: Et spie dat jem	en ad feminandum
11 HCAN .: 0,000 :	INION I OWING . IN	1. Sou 3.04	H ONK :	t : OA Die Ohin h	es fitis in omni gas ec adminiferatio bu
777: Hit: 146:	An INHTE COM	1. SOU 3.04	·C · 0000 : 48	nh:=: cam , in Sant	oi am eorum occulte lis ejus Et gyati lis miniflerio Chrift
13 ወደአኵትም : በለግዚ/	111124 1 110-110-7	1. 111 4 500 1	ወአስተመፀእክው	man expensions en	tes vos. Et illi or.
14 00:=> 0700744:	non:== 0hmt	: እግዚለብሱር	: በአነተ : እጋሁ ፣	NATH, "It quando note	pinati fiierint.
አብሔር : አንተ : ተማ	በቴድሮስ ፡ ሰማር	ት : ምንበብ:=፡	ወበ.ም.ሕረተ ፡፡ ክርስ	fit : ' Er mun	Pro Theo
1 1 ወለስተበቀ-ሪክው ፡ ስው : ሶበ : አሂሱ : ተበ 2 ሴክው :=፦ ወብቀ-ው	170 : ON: 17:	0786 : 00406	< ሊሀሰውኩ : እስ አውኝ : በተፋቅሮ	the : no chrift, quia q	uum prafens fim ap confido in vobis. E fum frenuus effe, qu
2 (110-1=> 0114-0-	2: 110. 111	1.+ 10.4 . 70	N. 079. 111	: 500 mra, o aujus	with foremand offers of

اَيُّ اَحَد وَيَّقَ مِذَادَه أَمَّه

• فَلْيَفْتُكُمْ فِي دَايَهُ أَسْضًا عَنْ ا • أَنَّهُ كَا هُوَ لَلْوَ TINI C A P. X.

745

Image 3: The corresponding page from 2 Corinthians in the London Polyglot. The Arabic text on the right-side page is the same as in Image 2, except for minor variants.

Here is a characteristic example

2 Cor. 10:3-5: ³ έν σαρκὶ γὰρ περιπατοῦντες οὐ κατὰ σάρκα στρατευόμεθα — ⁴ τὰ γὰρ ὅπλα τῆς στρατείας ἡμῶν οὐ σαρκικὰ ἀλλὰ δυνατὰ τῷ θεῷ πρὸς καθαίρεσιν όχυρωμάτων — λογισμοὺς καθαιροῦντες ⁵ καὶ πᾶν ὕψωμα ἐπαιρόμενον κατὰ τῆς γνώσεως τοῦ θεοῦ, καὶ αἰχμαλωτίζοντες πᾶν νόημα εἰς τὴν ὑπακοὴν τοῦ Χριστοῦ.

KJV: 3 For though we walk in the flesh, we do not war after the flesh: 4 (For the weapons of our warfare are not carnal, but mighty through God to the pulling down of strongholds;) ⁵ Casting down imaginations, and every high thing that exalteth itself against the knowledge of God, and bringing into captivity every thought to the obedience of Christ

This is the translation in Arab^{Gr3}:

- أناننا وان كنّا سالكين بالبشرة فما تجنّدنا مخصوصًا بالبشرة 4 لأنّ اسلحة جنديّتنا ليست بشرية لكنّها مقتدرة بالله على هدم الحصون هادمين الافكار 5 وكلّ علّم يستعلى على معرفة الله وسابيين كلّ فطنة ورويّة الى طاعة المسيح

And this is how this text is translated in The Noetic Paradise

. [لنن كنّا نمشى بالبشرة فلم نتجنّد بما يختصّ بالبشرة 4 لأنّ اسلحة جنديّتنا ليست بشرية بل مقتدرة بالله على هدم الحصون وتنقض الافكار ⁵ وكلّ علّز يتعالى على معرفة الله [[وسابية كلّ معقول]] // [[تستبى كلّ معقول ورويّة]] الى طاعة المسبح

(The alternative variants in double brackets appear on two distinct occasions when this passage is cited.)

The similarities between the two translations are obvious - and down to such an idiosyncratic feature as the rendering of the Greek σάρξ ("flesh") as بشرة (presumably pronounced basara or bisra), under the influence of the Syriac anti-(besrā, "flesh"). (In ordinary Arabic, by contrast, basara means "skin.")

Nonetheless, it seems out of the question that the author of The Noetic Paradise was simply citing Arab^{Gr3}. The discrepancies are all too apparent. Though some may be explained on stylistic grounds (it is conceivable, for example, that the author of The Noetic Paradise could have changed من تجنّنا etc.), others cannot be explained this way.

Most crucially, Arab^{Gr3} renders the Greek participles καθαιροῦντες and αἰχμαλωτίζοντες (KJV: "pulling down" and "bringing into captivity" respectively) by masculine plural Arabic participles مادمين and تستبي / سابيت The Noetic Paradise, by contrast, uses feminine singular verbal and participial forms تستبي / سابين The underlying Greek text of The Noetic Paradise version must therefore have featured neuter plural participles καθαιροῦντα and αἰχμαλωτίζοντα, referring to ὅπλα, "weapons," hence the feminine singular (i.e., inanimate plural) forms in the Arabic translation.[4]

The Noetic Paradise and Biblia Arabica - Biblia Arabica

The fact that Arab^{Gr3} and *The Noetic Paradise* reflect discordant Greek variants proves that they are INDEPENDENT translations (both done from Greek). The fact that they are, nonetheless, so strikingly similar shows that these are two independent translations PRODUCED BY THE SAME TRANSLATOR.

This is a crucial piece of information which has far-reaching consequences for both Arab^{Gr3} and *The Noetic Paradise*. The histories of these two texts are bound together. They must have been rendered into Arabic by the same person, presumably in the same location (unless the translator travelled from place to place) and at roughly the same time. If we can identify further Arabic translations produced by the same person (and I believe this can be done), we will learn more about the provenance (i.e., the translation milieu) of both Arab^{Gr3} and *The Noetic Paradise*.

Though more research is needed to substantiate this conclusion, I believe textual evidence strongly suggests that both texts were translated into Arabic in Antioch or one of the surrounding monasteries in the late tenth or the first half of the eleventh century.[5]

Alexander Treiger (PhD 2008, Yale University) is Associate Professor of Religious Studies at Dalhousie University in Halifax, Nova Scotia. He is editor of the series "Arabic Christianity: Texts and Studies" (Brill) and co-editor of *The Orthodox Church in the Arab World (700-1700): An Anthology of Sources (2014), Heirs of the Apostles: Studies on Arabic Christianity in Honor of Sidney H. Griffith (2019), and Patristic Literature in Arabic Translations (2020). His interests include Arabic and Syriac Christianity, Islamic philosophy, theology, and mysticism, Graeco-Arabic Studies, and transmission of ideas from Late Antiquity to early Islam.*

Footnotes

[1] For a list of manuscripts and a critical edition and English translation of the last chapter, see Alexander Treiger, "*The Noetic Paradise (al-Firdaws al-'aqli*): Chapter XXIV," in: Barbara Roggema and Alexander Treiger (eds.), *Patristic Literature in Arabic Translations*, Leiden: Brill, 2020, pp. 328-376; for a translation of excerpts, see Alexander Treiger, "*The Noetic Paradise*," in: Samuel Noble and Alexander Treiger (eds.), *The Orthodox Church in the Arab World (700-1700): An Anthology of Sources*, DeKalb: Northern Illinois University Press, 2014, pp. 188-200 and 320-322; Александр Трейгер, "*Умный рай*: мистико-аскетический трактат в арабском переводе," *Симеол* 58 (2010): 297-316.

[2] I am deeply grateful to Vevian Zaki for generously sharing with me information on Arab^{Gr3} and sending me a copy of her dissertation prior to publication.

[3] For further details, please consult Treiger, "The Noetic Paradise (al-Firdaws al-'aqli): Chapter XXIV," pp. 342-344.

[4] 2 Cor. 10:4 is paraphrased with καθαιροῦντα instead of καθαιροῦντες, e.g., in John Chrysostom's On the Incomprehensible Nature of God, Homily I—see PG 48, col. 797; Jean Chrysostome, Sur l'incompréhensibilité de Dieu, Tome I (Homélies I-V) (Sources chrétiennes 28^{bis}), ed. Anne-Marie Malingrey, trans. Robert Flacelière, Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 1970, p. 130.

[5] As I hope to show in a future publication, the same translator is also behind many Arabic translations of Ephrem the Syrian. These particular Arabic Ephrem translations, as opposed to older ones produced in Palestine in the ninth century, make their first appearance in the eleventh century (in the eleventh-century manuscript Sinai ar. 312 + Sinai ar. NF Perg. 13, copied in the region of Antioch). Once the connection between Arab^{Gr3} and *The Noetic Paradise* on the one hand and these Arabic translations of Ephrem has been securely proven, it will be possible more accurately to date both Arab^{Gr3} and *The Noetic Paradise*. Together with these Arabic Ephrem versions, they would have to be dated to the eleventh century at the latest, and their provenance would have to be assigned to Antioch. On the Arabic Ephremiana, see especially Fr. Samir Khalil Samir's articles "Le Recueil éphrémien arabe des 52 homélies," *Orientalia Christiana Periodica* 39 (1973): 307-332; "Le recueil ephremien arabe des 30 homelies (Sinai Arabe 311)," *Parole de l'Orient* 4 (1973): 265-315; "Eine Homilien-Sammlung des Ephräm, der Codex Sinaiticus arabicus Nr 311," *Oriens Christianus* 58 (1974): 51-75; "L'Éphrem arabe: État des travaux," *Orientalia Christiana Analecta* 205 (1978): 229-242. This subject, of course, remains to be investigated further.

Alexander Treiger, Arabic Bible, Arabic Bible Translations, Bible in Arabic, Muslim Bible, Noetic Paradise, Pauline Epistles