ABSTRACT

Linguistic field research depends on collecting phrases and sentences as well as their geographical and social characteristics. Collecting such data is usually done by sending researchers in the field to ask questions and fill forms. This traditional field research is time-consuming, costly, and not free of biases. This demonstration paper presents metropolitalia, a Web-based crowdsourcing platform for linguistic field research aiming at overcoming some of the drawbacks of traditional linguistic field research. metropolitalia is built upon Agora, a market for trading with phrases and speculating on their characteristics (such as geographical spread and gender, age, and level of education of speakers) in a playful manner. Borsa Parole, a first game built upon Agora and presented here, incites players to express their own knowledge or, rather, beliefs and aims at gathering data for language studies. This paper describes Agora and Borsa Parole itself, reports on first evaluations of the data gathered so far, and shows a demonstration of Borsa Parole’s use.

1. INTRODUCTION

Linguistic field research is concerned with gathering and analyzing speech data from speakers of some language(s) under observation. The data gathered comprise the speech data itself as well as characteristics of the speakers such as their geographical location and social characteristics, like age, gender, or level of education. Traditionally, such multidimensional data are collected by sending scientists, typically doctoral students or other low paid researchers, to the speakers’ locations, usually in certain geographical regions, where they interview speakers, record and/or transliterate the interview, and report on these interviews by filling forms. This process is time-consuming because each researcher can only interview a limited number of speakers, costly because the researchers or students involved have to be paid, and furthermore can be biased because of (conscious or unconscious) preconceptions an interviewer might have [1]. As a consequence, only relatively limited areas can be covered by traditional linguistic field research.

The crowdsourcing platform metropolitalia—accessible at http://www.metropolitalia.org since August 2012—is conceived as a Web-based platform for linguistic field research. It encourages people to participate in the process of gathering a large linguistic dataset from a wide geographical area with low costs for the linguists. Such a participation of many users to reach certain goals—that are not necessarily known to the users—is called crowdsourcing, a current trend on the Web which provides a cost- and time-efficient way of gathering data [2]. One way to gather data using crowdsourcing is by employing games known as “games with a purpose” (“GWAP”) [9], which is the approach we describe in this paper.

We designed the market-based system Agora (Greek for “market”) for data gathering. On games based on Agora symbolic goods can be traded and speculated with. People can submit symbolic goods—like dialect phrases—together with their own assessment of characteristics of that symbolic good—where or within which social group the dialect phrase is used—and compare their own assessments with those of the community. Thus, one can speculate in both senses of forming conjectures and investing money with a symbolic good and its characteristics. One then receives a payment...

Permission to make digital or hard copies of all or part of this work for personal or classroom use is granted without fee provided that copies are not made or distributed for profit or commercial advantage and that copies bear this notice and the full citation on the first page. To copy otherwise, to republish, to post on servers or to redistribute to lists, requires prior specific permission and/or a fee.
in form of points, which can be seen as play-money or as tokens of expertise, when the community agrees. Agora is used as operating system of a first game called Borsa Parole, Italian for “word stock exchange”. On Borsa Parole, the better phrases and their characteristics are recognized by the user community, the more successful is a user expressing the same belief. A second game aiming at gathering complementary data, also based on Agora, is under development.

The Italian language is especially interesting for linguistic field research, making Borsa Parole excellent means for investigating how to perform linguistic field research via crowdsourcing. Indeed, the Italian language spoken today everywhere, in cities and countryside alike, and within all social groups is currently undergoing a divergence that originates in the big cities and spreads from there [5]. This makes today’s Italian different from languages such as German, English, or French. The manifold vernaculars – that is, unstandardized language varieties – differ from dialects – that is, languages socially or geographically subordinate to a (national or regional) standard language – and from each other in vocabulary, grammar, and/or pronunciation. In all cultures there is a considerable interest in language issues and in reflecting on one’s own language variations. People interested in their own language are likely to participate in Borsa Parole just for seeing what others disclose on the platform, both phrases they do not know and assessments they are not aware of.

Related Work.
Crowdsourcing [2] is applied in many different contexts, like the collaborative web platform Wikipedia or games solving image labeling tasks. Similar to crowdsourcing, human computation refers to applications in which humans consciously or unconsciously collaborate to solve problems that so far can not be solved purely algorithmically [6]. If a game is designed such that users solve this problem while playing the game, the application is called a GWAP [9]. Several GWAP have been designed that solve different problems, the first one being image labeling [9]. Also in linguistics, crowdsourcing has already been applied successfully, mainly in theoretical linguistics. Often Amazon Mechanical Turk is employed for human computation, where users are paid for completing small tasks [7]. An important conclusion of [7] is that the linguistic quality achieved using human computation is comparable to that of controlled laboratory studies. Further articles report on using GWAP for gathering corpora annotations [3, 8].

Prediction markets are employed for estimating what the results of unknown future events are. Here, users trade contracts whose payoff depends on such events [10]. In an efficient market, the price of such a contract directly correlates with the probability of the future event. Prediction markets are supposed to be efficient markets [10] and therefore can quite closely predict future events.

To the best authors’ knowledge, no other crowdsourcing using games than that built upon Agora have been proposed so far that rely on a market for gathering data for linguistic field research.

Contributions.
This paper demonstrates how linguistic field research can be performed by Web-based crowdsourcing. Agora accounts for this need by providing the exploitation systems for a first game for gathering quantitative and manifold data.

The contributions of this paper and of the associated demonstration are as follows:

- Presentation of the market-like operating system Agora;
- Presentation of the game Borsa Parole, run by Agora, aiming at gathering linguistic data and meta-data;
- First evaluation of data gathered so far with Borsa Parole.

2. AGORA: A MARKET FOR GATHERING DATA

Agora is a generic software for running Web-based playmarkets in which a community of users can share symbolic goods as well as assessments of characteristics of these symbolic goods. A symbolic good can be a text (as in metropolitalia), an image, an audio file, or any other inmaterial good (or combination thereof) that needs to be characterized by users. The good is symbolic in the sense that it can occur on Agora multiple times, be possessed by multiple users, and technically be transferable over the Internet. Agora makes it possible for a user to:

- add her own symbolic goods to the market,
- propose assessments for her own symbolic goods as well as for symbolic goods proposed by others,
- review and adapt her own assessments based on assessments from other users, and
- trade assessments with other users.

An assessment consists of a user assessing one or more characteristics of a symbolic good and additionally estimating which proportion of users are likely to assign the same characteristics as she does. All assessments for a symbolic good together represent the market’s view for the symbolic good and if a user agrees with the aggregated view of the market, she gains (play-)money. The closer her estimation is to the proportion of users assigning the same characteristics, the more money she gains. Assessments can be offered for sale for a user-defined price and bought by other users. Thus users can create their own portfolio of assessments and gather assessments they deem to be important or valuable.

If over time the agreement of an assessment diverges from the user’s estimation, the user loses part of the money the assessment was worth before. If it converges to her estimation, she gains money. When a user reconsider her assessments, for each one a summary of the other users’ assessments is displayed. Based on this feedback she can adjust her assessments to fit the market. Here, the market regulates itself and users are rewarded for visiting the platform again. As in real markets, rules can be defined to limit the amount or frequency of changes of an estimation, e.g., through imposing a transaction cost for each change.

In order to effectively gather data with social media operated by Agora, users are encouraged to suggest symbolic goods themselves. This is important to enliven the media run on Agora so that they can grow both in the number of symbolic goods gathered and in the number of their users.
3. BORSA PAROLE: TRADING WITH ONE’S OWN BELIEFS

Specifically on the platform metropolitalia, Agora is used for running the game Borsa Parole, where Italian dialect or vernacular phrases—that is, sentences or parts of sentences—are traded with.¹ In other possible applications of Agora, completely different symbolic goods could be traded with.

The goals of Borsa Parole are to gather new phrases and to encourage users to share their assessments on new or existing phrases. Specifically, the user is asked to indicate in which geographical region a phrase is spoken (see Figure 1), how many people recognize the phrase as being from that location, which word(s) of the phrase are linguistically distinct, and who the speakers are in terms of age, gender, and level of education. Each user action is optional, i.e., can be skipped, to give users freedom in their choice and to prevent false data if users do not know what to choose. The trade of assessments is excluded in this first version of Borsa Parole for the sake of simplicity and will be added at a later stage.

For being successful on Borsa Parole, one has to submit phrases with characteristics that many other users of Borsa Parole are likely to agree with, because there it is easier for others to determine the characteristics. As a consequence, success on Borsa Parole depends on how one is skilled at forecasting others’ conceptions. This is a typical case of a “beauty contest”, as Keynes described the effect in a speculative market where participants reflect on each others’ behaviour and adapt their behaviour accordingly [4]. However, while the beauty contest analogy was meant by Keynes as a criticism of speculation on financial markets, a beauty contest-like speculation contributes to the aim of Borsa Parole. Indeed, in linguistic field research the true opinion of a single speaker is much less relevant than her perception of the community’s opinion. In other words, for linguistic field research, speculating speakers are welcome!

¹So far, the game provides written sentences but an extension with spoken sentences is foreseen. This extension does not require any change in the media logic but only additional user interfaces for collecting and rendering spoken language.
word, it is well known in Sicily (island in the south of Italy).
Six months are a short period of time because such a platform
needed at least one or two years for being sufficiently
known, especially if—as in this case—no monetary rewards
are provided. Also, GWAP for linguistic field research are
uncommon and novel. Therefore, the data gathered so far
provide a positive signal on metropolitalia’s approach.

5. DEMONSTRATION

The demonstration (at http://www.vimeo.com/59723042
a screencast is available) shows the three most important
aspects of Agora with the game Borsa Parole: (1) users
assessing characteristics of existing phrases, (2) users adding
phrases to the platform, (3) users browsing the market’s
phrases and adjusting own assessments.

The user starts the game whereupon the first out of three
game rounds is started. A phrase in an Italian vernacular
or dialect—which we translate and explain for the user—is
displayed and the user can choose the geographical region
where she guesses that the phrase is spoken (see Figure 1).
Furthermore, the user can estimate how many other users
she thinks would choose the same region. Next, she can se-
lect individual words of the phrase that are specific for this
vernacular or dialect and specify the social attributes age,
gender, and level of education of speakers of the phrase.
After two more rounds—which can be skipped—a summary
with the user’s score and other users’ assessments are shown.
This first part of the demo shows that the gameplay is intu-
tuitive, gives users freedom in their actions, and provides
enough incentives for being accepted by many users. Also
the scoring system for earning play-money is demonstrated.

As a second aspect of Borsa Parole, the user is invited to
add a new phrase to the platform. This highlights the gath-
ering of new symbolic goods in addition to the assessment
of symbolic goods shown before. The user contributes the
phrase, its geographical origin, and the user’s estimation of
how many other users assign the same region.

Finally, browsing the phrases contributes to the attrac-
tiveness of the platform and shows the market mechanisms
of Agora. Users can look up the assessments of every phrase
on the platform and also compare own assessments to other
users’ assessments and adjust their own ones to the market.

6. OUTLOOK AND CONCLUSION

Agora is designed as a generic and modular system and
therefore its deployment (1) in complementary games and
(2) in other application areas than Italian linguistics is possi-
ble. As a complementary game to Borsa Parole, the game
Poker Parole, Italian for “word poker”, is under development
and will be available in the next few months. Poker Parole is
also based on Agora and shares many properties of its game-
play with Borsa Parole, with one exception: While success
on Borsa Parole comes from submitting commonly recog-
nized phrases, on Poker Parole it comes from submitting phrases that most users are not likely to recognize. Such
phrases are equally important for linguistic research and
therefore need to be gathered as well. The two games there-
fore will complement each other in the data they gather.
We envisage a similar game built upon Agora for the area
of art history on the Artigo platform where the symbolic
goods traded with would be artworks and the characteristics
assessed could be the artist, style, and epoch.

For linguistic field research, crowdsourcing has the po-
tential to gather a huge amount of data from many people
in a cost-effective way. The approach furthermore lowers
the risk of biased data and offers the possibility to conduct
long-term studies over several years, as it is comparatively
inexpensive to run a Web-based platform for several years.
The market-based game design provides new incentives for
users which in the evaluation are indicated to be accepted
by users. Its analogy to speculation on real markets further-
more yields richer meta-data for evaluation than traditional
questionnaire-based field research.

7. ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank Hubertus Kohle from the Institute for Art Hist-
ory at the Ludwig-Maximilian University of Munich and all
other Play4Science project members for useful suggestions.
This research has been funded in part by the German
Foundation of Research (DFG) within the project Play4Sci-

8. REFERENCES

[1] K. A. Davis. Qualitative Theory and Methods in
Applied Linguistics Research. TESOL Quarterly,
a Language Game for Collecting Coreference
Annotation. In Proceedings of the 3rd Linguistic
Annotation Workshop (ACL-IJCNLP), 2009.
Interest, and Money. Macmillan Cambridge University
Press, 1936.
Italienisch. Zeitschrift für italienische Sprache und
R. J. Brachman, W. W. Cohen, and T. Dietterich,
editors, Synthesis Lectures on Artificial Intelligence
and Machine Learning, pages 1–121. Morgan &
[7] R. Munro, S. Bethard, V. Kuperman, V. T. Lai,
Crowdsourcing and Language Studies: The new
Generation of Linguistic Data. In Proceedings of the
Workshop on Creating Speech and Language Data with
Amazon’s Mechanical Turk at NAACL-HLT, 2010.
L. Robaldo, and L. Ducceschi. Phrase Detectives:
Utilizing Collective Intelligence for Internet-Scale
Language Resource Creation. ACM Transactions on
Interactive Intelligent Systems, 2012.
Computer Game. In Proceedings of the SIGCHI
Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems
(CHI), 2004.
Journal of Economic Perspectives, 18(2):107–126,
2004.